We are grateful for the support and inspiration we have received from the STRIDE committee at the University of Michigan.
Developed by UTK faculty for the UTK community
ARCHITECTURE
CHEMICAL & BIOMOLECULAR ENGINEERING
CHEMISTRY
CIVIL & ENVIRONMENTAL ENGINEERING
COMMUNICATION
DESIGN
ELECTRICAL ENGINEERING & COMPUTER
SCIENCE
EDUCATIONAL PSYCHOLOGY & COUNSELING
ENTOMOLOGY & PLANT PATHOLOGY
LAW
LIBRARY
MANAGEMENT
MATERIAL SCIENCE & ENGINEERING
NUTRITION
PHYSICS
PSYCHOLOGY
PUBLIC HEALTH
RETAIL HOSPITALITY & TOURISM
SOCIAL WORK
SOCIOLOGY
THEORY AND PRACTICE IN TEACHER
EDUCATION

STRIDE serves at the request of the Provost’s Office.
PURPOSE OF STRIDE

To revitalize our efforts to hire and retain a diverse faculty by using peer-to-peer instruction about the academic research on bias and diversity.
TODAY’S PRESENTATION:

1. A “REAL” FACULTY MEETING
2. DIVERSITY
3. ISSUES AT UTK
4. SOURCES OF INEQUALITY
5. RESEARCH THEMES
6. RECOMMENDATIONS
A “real” faculty meeting

Please carefully watch the following video and make notes of issues you may observe.
TODAY’S PRESENTATION:

1. A “REAL” FACULTY MEETING
2. DIVERSITY
3. ISSUES AT UTK
4. SOURCES OF INEQUALITY
5. RESEARCH THEMES
6. RECOMMENDATIONS
SOCIAL DIVERSITY

All the ways that people within a culture are set apart from one another

Focus on inclusion of members of groups that have been historically, legally, and/or culturally hindered from full participation in academia.

Universities have traditionally marginalized women, racial/ethnic minority groups, LGBTQ+ faculty, and those with disabilities.

There are many facets of diversity and other forms may be important when we are discussing diversity.

Much of the literature focuses on gender or racial diversity.
In a group setting diversity can cause:

- Discomfort
- Awkward interactions
- More concern about disrespect
- Lack of trust
- Less communication

SOCIAL DIVERSITY

→ When we work in diverse groups, we tend to work harder, and we make better decisions.

→ When faced with a problem, diverse groups create solutions that are better, clearer, and work for more people.

**HYPOTHESIS 1:**

Women’s representation in top management has a positive effect on firm performance.

**HYPOTHESIS 2:**

The effect of women’s representation in top management on firm performance is positively moderated by innovation intensity.
**METHODS:** 15 years of panel data on the top management teams of the S&P 1,500 firms. The sample covered 1992–2006.

**FINDINGS:** Women’s representation in top management improved firm performance, when a firm’s strategy is focused on innovation.

### Table 4. Women’s Representation in Top Management & Measures of Firm Performance

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Measure</th>
<th>Return on Assets</th>
<th>Return on Equity</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Women’s Representation</td>
<td>-0.0043 (0.0027)</td>
<td>-0.0059 (0.0081)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Women’s Representation × Innovation Intensity</td>
<td>0.1592*** (0.0234)</td>
<td>0.2585*** (0.0787)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

***p < 0.01, **p < 0.05, p < 0.10. Standard errors are reported under each coefficient in parentheses.

Advantage of diversity in group deliberations?

- More careful deliberations
- More facts considered
- Fewer issues taken for granted
- Problems considered from larger set of viewpoints

---

Table 2
Group-Level Analyses of Deliberation Content

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Measure</th>
<th>Diverse group</th>
<th>All-White group</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Deliberation length, in min</td>
<td>50.67</td>
<td>38.49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No. of case facts discussed</td>
<td>30.48</td>
<td>25.93</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No. of factual inaccuracies</td>
<td>4.14</td>
<td>7.28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No. of uncorrected inaccurate statements</td>
<td>1.36</td>
<td>2.49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Amount of “missing” evidence cited</td>
<td>1.87</td>
<td>1.07</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No. of race-related issues raised</td>
<td>3.79</td>
<td>2.07</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No. of mentions of racism</td>
<td>1.35</td>
<td>0.93</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% of time mention of racism met with objection</td>
<td>22%</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note. Values with different subscript letters differ significantly at p ≤ .05; n = 15 diverse groups and 14 all-White groups.
TODAY’S PRESENTATION:

1. A “REAL” FACULTY MEETING
2. DIVERSITY
3. ISSUES AT UTK
4. SOURCES OF INEQUALITY
5. RESEARCH THEMES
6. RECOMMENDATIONS
GENDER DIVERSITY AT UTK

ISSUES AT UTK

UTK Office of Institutional Research and Assessment, https://oira.utk.edu/
GENDER DIVERSITY AT UTK

Non-Tenure Track
- 2013-2014:
  - Women: 58%
  - Men: 42%
- 2020-2021:
  - Women: 62%
  - Men: 38%

Assistant Professor
- 2013-2014:
  - Women: 50%
  - Men: 50%
- 2020-2021:
  - Women: 50%
  - Men: 50%

Associate Professor
- 2013-2014:
  - Women: 50%
  - Men: 50%
- 2020-2021:
  - Women: 50%
  - Men: 50%

Professor
- 2013-2014:
  - Women: 50%
  - Men: 50%
- 2020-2021:
  - Women: 50%
  - Men: 50%

ISSUES AT UTK

UTK Office of Institutional Research and Assessment, https://oira.utk.edu/
FULL-TIME INSTRUCTIONAL FACULTY BY GENDER, UTK, 2020-2021

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>COLLEGE</th>
<th>Women</th>
<th>Men</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Herbert College of Ag</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Architecture &amp; Design</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Arts &amp; Sci. - Humanities</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Arts &amp; Sci. - Natural Sci.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Arts &amp; Sci. - Social Sci.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comm. &amp; Inform.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ed. - Health &amp; Human Sci.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Haslam College of Business</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Law</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nursing</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social Work</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tickle College of Engineering</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Veterinary Medicine</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

NUMBER OF FACULTY

0 25 50 75 100 125 150 175 200

ISSUES AT UTK
FULL-TIME INSTRUCTIONAL FACULTY BY **GENDER**, UTK, 2020-2021

![Bar chart showing the full-time instructional faculty by gender across different colleges at UTK.](chart.png)

**College**:
- Herbert College of Ag
- Architecture & Design
- Arts & Sci.: Humanities
- Arts & Sci.: Social Sci.
- Comm. & Inform.
- Haslam College of Business
- Law
- Nursing
- Social Work
- Tickle College of Engineering
- Veterinary Medicine

**Gender**:
- Women
- Men

**Number of Faculty**
- 0
- 25
- 50
- 75
- 100
- 125
- 150
- 175
- 200

**Issues at UTK**
ALL FACULTY BY RACE / ETHNICITY, UTK, 2013–2014

- Multiracial (~3%)
- Am. Indian / Alaskan Native (~1%)
- Asian/Pacific Islander (~6%)
- Black/African American (~13%)
- Hispanic / Latinx (~19%)
- White (~60%)

U.S.A.

ALL FACULTY BY RACE / ETHNICITY, UTK, 2020–2021

- Multiracial (~3%)
- Am. Indian / Alaskan Native (~1%)
- Asian/Pacific Islander (~6%)
- Black/African American (~13%)
- Hispanic / Latinx (~19%)
- White (~60%)
Are women dropping out of the educational “pipeline” leading to careers in STEM?

Why were women choosing not to pursue careers in STEM fields?
The leaky pipeline for women

- Women are 25% less likely to become a full Professor within a maximum of 16 years.
- Women are 23% less likely than men to become an Associate Professor.
- Married women are 20% less likely than single women to enter a tenure track position.
- Women with young children are 29% less likely than women without young children to enter a tenure track position.

TODAY’S PRESENTATION:

1. A “REAL” FACULTY MEETING
2. DIVERSITY
3. ISSUES AT UTK
4. SOURCES OF INEQUALITY
5. RESEARCH THEMES
6. RECOMMENDATIONS
The Chef does everything but cook — that’s what wives are for!
**EXPLICIT BIAS**

Intentional & obvious
Leads to discrimination

**IMPLICIT BIAS**

Unintentional & subtle
Leads to discrimination
BIAS is impactful and pervasive

Learned early from family, peers, media

Learned without intention or awareness

Culturally shared
BIAS is impactful and pervasive

Learned early from family, peers, media

Learned without intention or awareness

Culturally shared
BIAS is impactful and pervasive

Learned early from family, peers, media

Learned without intention or awareness

Culturally shared
BIAS characteristics:

Social categories are automatically and unintentionally encoded.

Once categories are activated, bias can influence perception without awareness.

When does BIAS affect judgment?

- When the situation is ambiguous, stressful, or rushed
- When you are not motivated to think clearly
- When you are unaware of the effects of bias
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Structure</th>
<th>Sources of Inequality</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>STRIDE</td>
<td>TENNESSEE</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CANDIDATE A

Stanford University

HARVARD UNIVERSITY

CANDIDATE B

THE UNIVERSITY OF TENNESSEE KNOXVILLE

UNIVERSITY OF GEORGIA
Legacy applicants to elite schools were **45% more likely** to be accepted than other applicants.

Legacy applicants to elite schools were 45% more likely to be accepted than other applicants.

Non-legacy applicants must have SAT scores 160 points higher than legacy applicants to have the same chance of admission.

Legacy applicants to elite schools were **45% more likely** to be accepted than other applicants.

Non-legacy applicants must have SAT scores **160 points higher** than legacy applicants to have the same chance of admission.

Only **6.7%** of the total legacy pool consists of people of color.

TODAY’S PRESENTATION:

1. A “REAL” FACULTY MEETING
2. DIVERSITY
3. ISSUES AT UTK
4. SOURCES OF INEQUALITY
5. RESEARCH THEMES
6. RECOMMENDATIONS
STUDY:
Is the juror for a symphony affected by seeing the person who is trying out?

FINDINGS:

Major U.S. symphony orchestra audition data for 14,000 individuals showed that use of a screen, which concealed gender, increased the probability by 25% that a woman would advance from preliminary rounds (1970-1996).
LETTERS FOR MEN:

- Longer
- More references to CV, publications, patents, colleagues

LETTERS FOR WOMEN:

- Shorter
- More references to personal life
- More “doubt raisers”
When identical resumes are submitted for a position in Business except for different first names:

- Applicants with Black sounding names needed to send 50% more resumes to get a call back than applicants with white sounding names.

- White sounding names yielded as many callbacks as an additional eight years of experience for a black candidate.

Do science faculty exhibit a bias against female students that could contribute to the gender disparity in academic science?

Biology, chemistry, and physics professors at six research universities were asked to evaluate an application from a student applicant seeking a position as a lab manager. They were asked to rate:

- Competence
- Hireability
- Appropriate salary
- Their willingness to mentor them
- Likeability

**Method:**

Biology, chemistry, and physics professors at six research universities were asked to evaluate an application from a student applicant seeking a position as a lab manager. They were asked to rate:

- Competence
- Hireability
- Appropriate salary
- Their willingness to mentor them
- Likeability

**Research Study: Lab Manager in STEM**

The male student was rated higher on competence and hireability than the female student and was assigned a higher salary than the female student.
As search committees we often seek out ... 

- first authors
- invited talks
- research grants
Men are more likely to ...

- be **first authors** on scientific papers.
- be selected for **prestigious invited talks** than women.
- obtain **research grants** than women.

“Mountains are mole hills piled one on top of another.” - Virginia Valian
Break-out Discussion

What are the barriers, if any, to increasing diversity in your college/department?
TODAY'S PRESENTATION:

1. A “REAL” FACULTY MEETING
2. DIVERSITY
3. ISSUES AT UTK
4. SOURCES OF INEQUALITY
5. RESEARCH THEMES
6. RECOMMENDATIONS
Writing the position description ...

- Where appropriate, label qualifications **preferred** instead of required; use **should** instead of must.

- Whenever possible, **be flexible** with arbitrary numeric measures, such as years of experience.
Make your search as broad as possible

**BENEFITS OF BROAD SEARCHES**

- **Women Applicants**: Before using broad searches (AY01-AY04) vs. Using broad searches (AY06-AY09)
- **Women Hires**: Before using broad searches (AY01-AY04) vs. Using broad searches (AY06-AY09)
- **URM Hires (MEN)**: Before using broad searches (AY01-AY04) vs. Using broad searches (AY06-AY09)

- Broad searches led to a larger number of applicants AND a more diverse applicant pool.

Caroline S. V. Turner, “Diversifying the Faculty”, AAC&U.
Writing about the region ...

Original language:

Situated near the Smoky Mountains, our department offers a supportive and collegial atmosphere in which scholars make a variety of important contributions to the world.
Writing the position description ...

Original language:

Situated near the Smoky Mountains, our department offers a supportive and collegial atmosphere in which scholars make a variety of important contributions to the world.

New language:

The City of Knoxville is a hidden gem with a beautiful and walkable downtown, varied nightlife, active neighborhoods, and eclectic shopping and restaurants. UT is located within easy driving distance to Asheville, Nashville, Atlanta, and the Great Smoky Mountains.
Specifying the submission materials ...

Ask applicants ....

→ to describe their experience with diverse students and working in multicultural environments.

→ to include other materials such as copies of articles, and samples of course syllabi ...

Caroline S. V. Turner, “Diversifying the Faculty”, AAC&U.

BEFORE starting application review, sit down as a committee and ...

Discuss and define evaluation criteria in advance – not when under a deadline
BEFORE starting application review, sit down as a committee and ...

→ Discuss and define evaluation criteria in advance – not when under a deadline

→ Allocate approximate importance (weight) to the criteria.

→ Consider alternatives to simple rank ordering, for example, create summaries.
BEFORE starting application review, sit down as a committee and ...

→ Discuss and define evaluation criteria in advance – not when under a deadline

→ Allocate approximate importance (weight) to the criteria.

→ Consider alternatives to simple rank ordering, for example, create summaries.

→ Calibrate your evaluations by discussing 1-2 applications in detail before beginning the review process.
During application review,

- Focus on all the work, not just the first pages of the CV.

- Be aware of the potential different environments the candidates have been in during their whole career.
Self-correction: Be aware of the possibility of your own implicit bias.

Slow down and deliberate!
Before any campus visit, 
provide all applicants with ..

→ All appropriate policy information. (ex: family friendly policies, partner hiring options, etc. ...)

→ Details on the kind of presentation they will be expected to make and of the audience for it.
Before any campus visit, ask all applicants:

- Is there any particular person or group you would like to meet with while here?

- OR any particular location you would like to visit?

- Would you like one or two 15 to 20-minute private breaks to be included in the schedule? If so, ask when they would like for them to be scheduled?
While on a campus visit,

- Ensure that all candidates meet a diverse set of people, including graduate and undergraduate students and staff.

- If raised by the candidate, the interests and needs of the candidate’s family or partner should be addressed during the interview.

- Think carefully about how you’re presenting your department, the university, and Knoxville.
CONCLUSION SUMMARY

Diversity produces a better “product” in innovative work environments, and more well-considered solutions.

Most of us have internalized implicit biases that can dominate the decision-making processes, such as hiring decisions.

Structural conditions also limit opportunities for excellent URM applicants.

Level the playing field.