STRATEGIES and TACTICS for RECRUITING to IMPROVE DIVERSITY and EXCELLENCE

at The University of Tennessee

stride@utk.edu

We are grateful for the support and inspiration we have received from the STRIDE committee at the University of Michigan.
Developed by UTK faculty for the UTK community

ART
ARCHITECTURE
BIOLOGY
BOTANY
CHEMICAL & BIOMOL. ENGINEERING
CHEMISTRY
CIVIL & ENVIRON. ENGINEERING
EDUCATIONAL PSYCHOLOGY

ENTOMOLOGY & PLANT PATHOLOGY
LAW
NUCLEAR PHYSICS
NUTRITION
PSYCHOLOGY
RETAIL HOSPITALITY & TOURISM
SOCIAL WORK
SOCIOLOGY

STRIDE serves at the request of the Provost’s Office.
PURPOSE OF STRIDE

To revitalize our efforts to hire and retain a diverse faculty by using peer-to-peer instruction about the academic research on bias and diversity

STUDY & INSTRUCTION METHOD

Peer Reviewed Academic Research

Committee Discussion

UTK Presentations
TODAY’S PRESENTATION:

1. DIVERSITY
2. ISSUES AT UTK
3. BIAS
4. RESEARCH STUDIES
5. RECOMMENDATIONS
1. DIVERSITY / CHALLENGES & BENEFITS

2. ISSUES AT UTK
3. BIAS
4. RESEARCH STUDIES
5. RECOMMENDATIONS
SOCIAL DIVERSITY

All the ways that people within a single culture are set apart from one another

Focus on inclusion of members of groups that have been historically, legally, and/or culturally hindered from full participation in academia.

In a group setting diversity can cause:

- Discomfort
- Rougher interactions
- More concern about disrespect
- Lack of trust
- Less communication

SOCIAL DIVERSITY

→ Encourages the search for novel information and perspectives, leading to better decision making and problem solving.

→ When problems are solved in diverse groups, solutions tend to be better formulated, explained in more detail, addressed from more perspectives, and work better in innovative environments.

---

Most examples and case studies in this presentation deal with gender or racial diversity because most research studies have focused on these aspects of diversity.

However, there are many facets of diversity and they are ALL important when we are discussing diversity.
HYPOTHESIS 1:
Female representation in top management has a positive effect on firm performance.

HYPOTHESIS 2:
The effect of female representation in top management on firm performance is positively moderated by innovation intensity.

FINDINGS: Female representation in top management improved firm performance, but only to the extent that a firm’s strategy is focused on innovation.

Table 4. Women’s Representation in Top Management & Measures of Firm Performance

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Measure</th>
<th>Return on Assets</th>
<th>Return on Equity</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Women’s Representation</td>
<td>-0.0043 (0.0027)</td>
<td>-0.0059 (0.0081)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Women’s Representation × Innovation Intensity</td>
<td>0.1592*** (0.0234)</td>
<td>0.2585*** (0.0787)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

***p < 0.01, **p < 0.05, p< 0.10. Standard errors are reported under each coefficient in parentheses.
STUDY:
People (86) with different political ideologies (Democrats and Republicans) were asked to read a murder mystery case, and prepare for a meeting with another participant by writing an essay about who they thought committed the murder.

They were told that

- the other participant disagreed with them
- they needed to reach consensus
- the other participant was from either the opposing political party or the same party as themselves

RESULT:

When Democrats were told that they would meet with another Democrat who disagreed with them, they prepared less well for the discussion than Democrats who were told that they would meet with a Republican who disagreed with them. Republicans showed the same pattern.

LESSON:

When disagreement comes from a socially different person, we are prompted to work harder. Diversity jolts us into cognitive action in ways that homogeneity simply does not.

STUDY:

Does the gender of undergraduate women’s math and science professors affect women’s performance in math and science courses?
METHOD:
Authors compared the math and science course grades of 9,481 undergraduate students at the U.S. Air Force Academy. They compared the grades of men and women students according to whether the students had men or women math and science professors.
FINDINGS:
Women’s performance in math and science courses improves substantially when the course is taught by a woman professor, while the effect of professor gender on men students is negligible.

DIVERSITY BENEFITS

**INFORMATIONAL DIVERSITY:**
When innovation or careful considerations are important, diverse groups and institutions perform better.

**BETTER WORKFORCE PREPARATION:**
A diverse faculty and student body will prepare our students better for the very diverse world they will encounter during their lives.

**DIVERSITY INCREASES DIVERSITY:**
New minority faculty, staff, and students are more likely to come to institutions with good track records on diversity.
2. DIVERSITY

ISSUES AT UTK

BIAS

RESEARCH STUDIES

RECOMMENDATIONS
GENDER DIVERSITY AT UTK

2013–2014

All Faculty by Gender

Women: 41%
Men: 59%

2017–2018

All Faculty by Gender

Women: 44%
Men: 56%

RANK DISTRIBUTION AT UTK

2013–2014

All Faculty by Rank

Professor: 29%
Associate Professor: 24%
Assistant Professor: 22%
Non-tenure Track: 25%

2017–2018

All Faculty by Rank

Professor: 29%
Associate Professor: 22%
Assistant Professor: 23%
Non-tenure Track: 26%
GENDER DIVERSITY AT UTK, 2013–2014

Non-Tenure Track
- Women: 58%
- Men: 42%

Assistant Professor
- Women: 50%
- Men: 50%

Associate Professor
- Women: 41%
- Men: 59%

Professor
- Women: 20%
- Men: 80%

GENDER DIVERSITY AT UTK, 2017–2018

Non-Tenure Track
- Women: 61%
- Men: 39%

Assistant Professor
- Women: 50%
- Men: 50%

Associate Professor
- Women: 44%
- Men: 56%

Professor
- Women: 26%
- Men: 74%
FULL-TIME INSTRUCTIONAL FACULTY BY GENDER, UTK, 2016–2017

- STRIDE
ALL FACULTY BY RACE / ETHNICITY, UTK, 2013–2014

- Multiracial: 83%
- Am. Indian / Alaskan Native: 1%
- Asian/Pacific Islander: 4%
- Black/African American: 9%
- Hispanic: 4%

ISSUES AT UTK

ALL FACULTY BY RACE / ETHNICITY, UTK, 2017–2018

- Multiracial: 82%
- Am. Indian / Alaskan Native: 1%
- Asian/Pacific Islander: 4%
- Black/African American: 9%
- Hispanic: 4%

STRIDE

UTK Office of Institutional Research and Assessment, https://oira.utk.edu/
Are women dropping out of the educational “pipeline” leading to careers in STEM?

Why were women choosing not to pursue careers in STEM fields?
The *leaky pipeline* for women

- Women are 25% less likely to become a full Professor within a maximum of 16 years.
- Women are 23% less likely than men to become an Associate Professor.
- Married women are 20% less likely than single women to enter a tenure track position.
- Women with babies are 29% less likely than women without babies to enter a tenure track position.

3. DIVERSITY

ISSUES AT UTK

BIAS

RESEARCH STUDIES

RECOMMENDATIONS
The Chef does everything but cook - that's what wives are for!

I'm giving my wife a Kenwood Chef
EXPLICIT BIAS
Intentional & obvious
Leads to discrimination

VS.

IMPLICIT BIAS
Unintentional & subtle
Leads to discrimination
BIAS is impactful and pervasive

Learned early from family, peers, media

Learned without intention or awareness

Culturally shared
BIAS is impactful and pervasive

Learned early from family, peers, media

Learned without intention or awareness

Culturally shared
BIAS characteristics:
Social categories are automatically and unintentionally encoded.
Once categories are activated, bias can influence perception without awareness.

BIAS can:
change based on experience / exposure
be reduced based on conscious considerations

When does BIAS affect judgment?

- When the situation is ambiguous, stressful, or rushed.
- When you are not motivated to think clearly.
- When you are unaware of the effects of bias.

4. RESEARCH STUDIES
STUDY:
Is the juror for a symphony affected by seeing the person who is trying out?

STUDY:
Is the juror for a symphony affected by seeing the person who is trying out?

FINDINGS:
Major U.S. symphony orchestra audition data for 14,000 individuals showed that use of a screen, which concealed gender, *increased the probability by 25%* that a woman would advance from preliminary rounds (1970-1996).
LETTERS FOR MEN:

- Longer
- More references to CV, publications, patents, colleagues

LETTERS FOR WOMEN:

- Shorter
- More references to personal life
- More “doubt raisers”
Many of the case studies we have studied are “classical” studies chosen because they illustrate issues related to implicit bias well.

However, some of them are 20-40 years old, so maybe people’s attitudes and biases have changed and these studies are now obsolete?

In order to test if that is indeed happening (which would be great!) the next case study is from 2012 ....
Do science faculty exhibit a bias against female students that could contribute to the gender disparity in academic science?

METHOD:
Biology, chemistry, and physics professors at six research universities were asked to evaluate an application from a student applicant seeking a position as a lab manager.

They were asked to rate:

- Competence
- Hireability
- Appropriate salary
- Their willingness to mentor them
- Likeability

The male student was rated higher on competence and hireability than the female student and was assigned a higher salary than the female student.
Do psychology faculty exhibit a bias against women candidates?

METHOD:
238 psychology faculty evaluated the CVs of either a man or woman candidate for a faculty position. CVs were identical except for the names of the candidates (“Karen Miller” vs. “Brian Miller”).

Each candidate had:
- Completed their PhD
- 9 publications
- 9 conference presentations
- Some teaching experience

FINDINGS:
Psychology faculty participants were more likely to hire the man than the woman candidate, even though the CVs were identical.

Both men and women participants exhibited this gender bias.

WHEN SINGLE GENDER GROUP AT THE TABLE, 
the person at the head of the table is perceived as the leader.

WHEN MIXED GENDER GROUP AT THE TABLE, 
a female at the head of the table is identified as the leader \textit{half as often} as a male.

Men are more likely to be *first authors* on scientific papers.

Men are more likely to be selected for prestigious *invited talks* than women.

Men are more likely to obtain *research grants* than women.

Mothers are rated *less* competent and recommended for *lower salaries* than non-mothers.

Fathers are rated *more* competent and recommended for *higher salaries* than non-fathers.

Mountains are mole hills piled one on top of another.....(Virginia Valian)
STEREOTYPE THREAT

Stereotype threat is a self-threatening phenomenon where individuals perform in testing situations at the level that they are expected to based on the group to which they belong.

Stereotype threat introduces a risk to individuals during testing situations that individuals without the threat do not experience.

STUDY:
Undergraduate female Asian American math test results can be manipulated by activating different parts of their cultural identity.

METHODS:
Researchers “primed” 46 undergraduate Asian American female participants prior to a test by either:

→ asking identity activation questions such as “Do you live in a co-ed dorm?”

→ asking ethnicity activation questions such as “Do you live in a home where a second language is spoken?”

All prior to a 12 question math test to be taken in 20 minutes.
People perform the way they are “expected” to perform

OUTCOME:
The math test results showed that:

- the group of female students whose Asian identity was activated had the highest scores
- the control group had intermediate scores
- students whose female identity was activated had the worst score.

Both positive and negative cultural stereotypes can interfere with individual performances.
5. RECOMMENDATIONS

DIVERSITY

ISSUES AT UTK

BIAS

RESEARCH STUDIES
The Three Phases of the Search and Hiring Process

**STRIDE 1**

BEFORE the
search begins.

**STRIDE 2**

The search
PROCESS.

AFTER
the search.
External Activities

- Network directly with young scholars, including your own students.
- Foster connections with other institutions to identify and track promising candidates.
- Widen the pool: actively pursue candidates thriving at lower-ranked institutions.
- In general, go beyond the “usual” set of institutions from which you might consider candidates.

Internal Activities

- Develop “buy in” to the importance of diversity and inclusion

- A good way for units to strengthen their commitment to diversity is to explicitly incorporate faculty diversity as a goal.

- Develop a diversity plan through an inclusive process.

- Invite diverse scholars for your colloquia and seminars
Do not rush the hiring process

→ Conduct searches **early** in the semester.

→ Select committee members who will make the **needed commitment** in time and effort.

→ Give search committees **plenty of time**

---

RECOMMENDATIONS: THE SEARCH

Caroline S. V. Turner, “Diversifying the Faculty”, AAC&U.

Make your search as broad as possible

→ Define your search as broadly as possible.
→ Job description should include as many areas as possible.
→ Consider using a single committee for all open searches in your unit.
Make your search as broad as possible

**BENEFITS OF BROAD SEARCHES**

- Broad searches led to both a larger number of applicants AND a more diverse applicant pool.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Before using broad searches (AY01–AY04)</th>
<th>Using broad searches (AY06–AY09)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>WOMEN APPLICANTS</td>
<td>10%</td>
<td>60%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WOMEN HIRES</td>
<td>20%</td>
<td>50%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>URM HIRES (MEN)</td>
<td>30%</td>
<td>40%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Caroline S. V. Turner, “Diversifying the Faculty”, AAC&U.
Creating the position description - 1

→ Ask applicants to describe their experience with **diverse students** and working in multicultural environments

→ In addition to a letter of application and a curriculum vitae, request other materials such as **copies of articles**, ..., and samples of course **syllabi**.
Creating the position description - II

→ Be positive and inclusive

Original language:

Situated near the Smoky Mountains, our department offers a supportive and collegial atmosphere in which scholars make a variety of important contributions to the world.

New language:

The City of Knoxville is a hidden gem with a beautiful and walkable downtown, varied nightlife, active neighborhoods, and eclectic shopping and restaurants. UT is located within easy driving distance to Asheville, Nashville, Atlanta, and the Great Smoky Mountains.

Creating the position description - III

- Where appropriate, label qualifications preferred instead of required; use should instead of must.

- Whenever possible, be flexible with arbitrary numeric measures, such as years of experience.
Be Active - I

- Don’t just wait for applications to arrive. Seek and encourage URMs to apply.
- Make telephone calls.
- Send personalized letters to potential applicants or to those who might refer potential applicants.
- Write e-mails.
Be Active - II

- Talk face-to-face with people who might nominate or recommend potential candidates, stressing the unit's commitment to diversity

- Approach potential applicants at professional meetings and personally encourage their application for the position

- Consult with minority faculty members on campus about the types of outreach they consider most effective

Caroline S. V. Turner, “Diversifying the Faculty”, AAC&U.
The Evaluation - I

- Focus on all the work done by the applicants, not just the first page of their CVs.
- Consider unit needs beyond area fit.
- Remember that candidates from the “best” schools aren’t necessarily the best scholars.

Caroline S. V. Turner, “Diversifying the Faculty”, AAC&U.
The Evaluation - II

→ Discuss and define evaluation criteria in advance.
→ Allocate approximate importance (weight) for the criteria
→ Global assessments of candidates are more consistent with stereotypes.
→ Consider alternatives to simple rank ordering *(maybe create summaries).*
→ Calibrate your evaluations by discussing 1-2 applications in detail before beginning the review process.
The Evaluation - III

→ Self-correction: Be aware of the possibility of your own implicit bias.

→ Be aware of the potential different environments the candidates have been in during the whole career

→ Avoid overweighing ‘liking’ or personality fit, which favors candidate consistency with implicit biases

→ Slow down and be deliberate!
The Campus Interview - I

Ensure that all candidates meet a diverse set of people, including graduate and undergraduates students and staff.

Distribute appropriate policy information to all candidates before or during first visit. (ex: family friendly policies, partner hiring options, quality of school systems in the area, etc ...)
Candidates should be asked if there are special people, special groups of people, or special locations they would like to meet or visit.

They also should be made aware of the kind of presentation they will be expected to make and of the audience for it.

If raised by the candidate, the interests and needs of the candidate's family or partner should be addressed during the interview.
Too often emphasis is on evaluating the candidate and not on attracting the candidate.

Think carefully about how you’re presenting your department, the university, and Knoxville.
The Campus Interview - IV

Show the department as it is now .... not how it was

CONCLUSION SUMMARY

Diversity produces a better “product” in innovative work environments

Most of us have *internalized implicit biases* that can dominate the decision making processes, such as hiring decisions.

Implicit biases tend to *propagate the status quo*.

We do not wish to lower the bar for minorities, but instead, we wish to level the playing field.
Please remember one thing ...

Implicit bias surfaces when decisions have to be made under duress, time is limited, or the situation is ambiguous.
Please remember one thing ...

Awareness of one’s implicit biases and motivation to not let it rule your decisions can change the outcome.
Thank you.

Email: stride@utk.edu
Web: http://stride.utk.edu